DEBATE TOPIC:

Resolved: *The U.S. Government should ban the collection of personal data through biometric recognition technology*.

BACKGROUND:

How much does facial recognition affect everyday life? Whilst facial recognition technology may seem akin to science fiction, it is silently creeping its way into the European policy mainstream. After trialing facial recognition at Berlin-Südkreuz station since 2018, Germany is currently planning to roll out biometric surveillance systems in an additional 134 train stations and 14 airports despite criticism. France relies heavily on facial recognition technologies, with President Macron set to catch up with China and the United States. Italian police also started deploying the Automatic Image Recognition System (SARI) in 2017, targeting not just a few individuals but processing the biometric data of everyone present in spaces monitored for the purpose of identifying certain individuals. Recently, Belgrade (Serbia) installed hundreds of face recognition cameras, creating a permanent surveillance system. Unbeknownst to much of the general public, facial recognition is becoming increasingly common throughout Europe. Luckily, recent legal rulings in some countries have found such facial recognition systems to be unlawful.
-- *[Facial Recognition: Pros And Cons (Civil Liberties Union for Europe, August 3, 2021)](#)*

This article addresses the best ways to mitigate the various privacy and discrimination risks inherent in the use of biometric monitoring in the workplace. While the federal and state regulation of monitoring workers is in its infancy, biometric monitoring itself is expanding rapidly. Innovations in wearables, rising healthcare costs, personalized medicine, and the use of health data clearinghouses are among the factors fueling this expansion. This article analyzes the harms of misusing biometric and health data in the workplace as well as the limitations of current regulatory schemes and offers three possible ways to curb those harms, varying in degrees of interventionism. -- *[Healthy Mistrust: Curbing Biometric Data Misuse in Workplace (Stanford Technology Law Review, 2020)](#)*

BACKGROUND: *Continued…*

Developing countries increasingly use biometric identification technology in hopes of improving the reliability of administrative information and delivering social services more efficiently. This paper exploits the random placement of biometric tracking devices in tuberculosis treatment centers in urban slums across four Indian states to measure their effects both on disease control and on the quality of health records. The devices record health worker attendance and patient adherence to treatment, and they automatically generate prompts to follow up with patients who miss doses. Combining data from patient and health worker surveys, independent field visits, and government registers, we first find that patients enrolled at biometric-equipped centers are 25 percent less likely to interrupt treatment—an improvement driven by increased attendance and efforts by health workers and greater treatment adherence by patients. Second, biometric tracking decreases data forgery: it reduces overreporting of patient numbers in both NGO data and government registers and underreporting of treatment interruptions. Third, the impact of biometric tracking is sustained over time and it decreases neither health worker satisfaction nor patient satisfaction. Overall, our results suggest biometric tracking technology is both an effective and sustainable way to improve the state's capacity to deliver healthcare in challenging areas.

-- Biometric Monitoring, Delivery & Misreporting: Healthcare in India, (Harvard Business School, 2019)

REQUIRED RESEARCH (VIDEOS & MEDIA):

Science of Innovation: Biometrics,
NBC News, May 4, 2020 [5 min]
https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=hv31ZESxoTQ

Advanced facial recognition technology | Marios Savvides,
World Economic Forum, February 21, 2018 [5 min]
https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=U15FWjOWqgQ&list=TLGGkDtOgxs2EWkwNTAzMjAyMw

A Face in the Crowd: Say goodbye to anonymity,
CBS News, May 20, 2013 [13 min]
https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=mnfWZvU_Jqo&list=TLGGYm2-NVpttkIwNTAzMjAyMw

REQUIRED RESEARCH (ARTICLES):

Facial Recognition Technology: Here Are The Important Pros and Cons,
Forbes Magazine, August 19, 2019 [PDF]
https://www.forbes.com/sites/bernardmarr/2019/08/19/facial-recognition-technology-here-are-the-important-pros-and-cons/

Beijing's Plan to Control the World's Data: Out-Google Google,
Newsweek, September 7, 2022 [PDF]
https://www.newsweek.com/2022/09/16/beijings-plan-control-worlds-data-out-google-google-1740426.html

TikTok Has Started Collecting Your 'Faceprints' and 'Voiceprints',
TIME Magazine, June 14, 2021 [PDF]
https://time.com/6071773/tiktok-faceprints-voiceprints-privacy/

White Castle Could Face Multibillion-Dollar Judgment in Illinois Privacy Lawsuit,
US News & World Report, February 17, 2023 [PDF]
https://www.usnews.com/news/technology/articles/2023-02-17/white-castle-could-face-multibillion-dollar-judgment-in-illinois-privacy-lawsuit

OPTIONAL RESEARCH (PROS & CONS):

The Pros and Cons of Biometrics,
CEO World Magazine, May 9, 2022 [PDF]
https://ceoworld.biz/2022/05/09/the-pros-and-cons-of-biometrics/

Facial Recognition: PROS & CONS of Regulating Biometric Technology,
Congressional Digest, April 2020
https://congressionaldigest.com/issue/facial-recognition/

The Pros and Cons of Voice Biometrics Technology,
CX Today, June 3, 2021
https://www.cxtoday.com/contact-centre/weighing-the-pros-and-cons-of-voice-biometrics-technology/

Pros and Cons of Facial Recognition – Everything You Need to Know,
Tech Research Online, September 2, 2021
https://techresearchonline.com/blog/pros-and-cons-of-facial-recognition/

OPTIONAL RESEARCH (PROS & CONS): *Continued…*

Pros and Cons of Facial Recognition - Is it a Blessing or a Curse in Disguise?,
BBN Times, November 02, 2022
https://www.bbntimes.com/technology/pros-and-cons-of-facial-recognition-is-it-a-blessing-or-a-curse-in-disguise

Facial Recognition in the Workplace: The Pros and Cons,
Industry Today, February 21, 2023
https://industrytoday.com/facial-recognition-in-the-workplace-the-pros-and-cons/

Advantages & Disadvantages of Facial Recognition,
Environmental Conscience, Last Accessed: March 2023
https://environmental-conscience.com/facial-recognition-pros-cons/

8 Pros and Cons of Facial Recognition: Impact on Society,
Foundation for the Future dot org, January 26, 2022
https://www.foundationforfuture.org/8-pros-and-cons-of-facial-recognition-on-society/

7 Biggest Privacy Concerns Around Facial Recognition Technology,
Civil Liberties Union for Europe, October 25, 2022
https://www.liberties.eu/en/stories/facial-recognition-privacy-concerns/44518

Facial Recognition: Pros and Cons,
Civil Liberties Union for Europe, August 3, 2021
https://www.liberties.eu/en/stories/pros-and-cons-of-facial-recognition/43708

OPTIONAL RESEARCH (ARTICLES & VIDEOS):

AI Company Scraped Billions of Photos For Facial Recognition. Regulators Can't Stop It,
TIME Magazine, May 27, 2022 [PDF]
https://time.com/6182177/clearview-ai-regulators-uk/
Note: *This will be one of our strongest arguments - regulations won't work (fines will fail).*

Biometrics: definition, use cases, latest news,
The Thales Group, Last Updated: January 27, 2022 [PDF]
https://www.thalesgroup.com/en/markets/digital-identity-and-security/government/inspired/biometrics
Note: *This is a comprehensive document explaining nearly everything about the topic.*

U.S. Deploys Technology to Track More Than 200,000 Immigrants, Triggering Privacy Lawsuit,
TIME Magazine, April 18, 2022 [PDF]
https://time.com/6167467/immigrant-tracking-ice-technology-data/

How Technology and Training Can Stop Human Trafficking in its Tracks,
Newsweek, September 28, 2022 [PDF]
https://www.newsweek.com/how-technology-training-can-stop-human-trafficking-its-tracks-1746698

Biometric Data: Massive Security Risk or the Only Way Forward for COVID-19 Safety?,
Annemarie Mannion, Risk and Insurance, August 4, 2020 [PDF]
https://riskandinsurance.com/biometric-data-massive-security-risk-or-the-only-way-forward-for-covid-19-safety/

Eight case studies on regulating biometric technology show us a path forward,
MIT Technology Review, September 4, 2020
https://www.technologyreview.com/2020/09/04/1008164/ai-biometric-face-recognition-regulation-amba-kak/

The IRS Should Stop Using Facial Recognition,
The Atlantic, January 27, 2022
https://www.theatlantic.com/ideas/archive/2022/01/irs-should-stop-using-facial-recognition/621386/

Racial Discrimination in Face Recognition Technology,
Science in the News, Harvard University, October 24, 2020
https://sitn.hms.harvard.edu/flash/2020/racial-discrimination-in-face-recognition-technology/

Passwords Are Terrible, but Will Biometrics Be Any Better?,
Harvard Business Review, May 11, 2017
https://hbr.org/2017/05/passwords-are-terrible-but-will-biometrics-be-any-better

Biometrics Won't Solve Our Data-Security Crisis,
Harvard Business Review, Dec 06, 2017
https://hbr.org/2017/12/biometrics-wont-solve-our-data-security-crisis

Tracing the Untraceable: New Technologies Monitor Displaced Persons & History of Population Control,
Harvard International Review, May 24, 2021
https://hir.harvard.edu/new-technologies-that-monitor-displaced-persons/

Biometric Monitoring, Service Delivery and Misreporting: Evidence from Healthcare in India,
Harvard Business School (Working Paper), October 2019
https://www.hbs.edu/faculty/Pages/item.aspx?num=55885

A Healthy Mistrust: Curbing Biometric Data Misuse in the Workplace,
Prof. Elizabeth A. Brown, Harvard University, Stanford Technology Law Review, 2020
https://law.stanford.edu/wp-content/uploads/2020/06/Brown-A-Healthy-Mistrust.pdf

How a New Generation Is Combatting Digital Surveillance,
Princeton University, June 4, 2022
https://aas.princeton.edu/news/how-new-generation-combatting-digital-surveillance

The Challenges of Facial Recognition Technologies,
Stanford University, April 23, 2020
https://hai.stanford.edu/news/challenges-facial-recognition-technologies

Regulating Facial Recognition Technology in the Private Sector,
Stanford Technology Law Review, 2020
https://law.stanford.edu/publications/regulating-facial-recognition-technology-in-the-private-sector/

HAI Fellow Michelle Spektor: How the History of Biometrics Informs Its Future,
Stanford University, June 3, 2021
https://hai.stanford.edu/news/hai-fellow-michelle-spektor-how-history-biometrics-informs-its-future

Now You See Me. Now You Still Do: Facial Recognition Technology and the Growing Lack of Privacy,
Prof. Dov Greenbaum, Yale University, Boston University Journal of Science & Technology Law, Winter 2017
https://www.bu.edu/jostl/files/2017/04/Greenbaum-Online.pdf

Face/Off: The Battle To Authenticate With Biometrics,
Yale Journal of Law and Technology, April 15, 2021
https://yjolt.org/blog/faceoff-battle-authenticate-biometrics

Researchers Warn of Problems Using Mobile Technologies in Public Health Care,
Yale School of Medicine, January 2, 2019
https://medicine.yale.edu/news-article/researchers-warn-of-problems-using-mobile-technologies-in-public-health-care/

Paying for Privacy and the Personal Data Economy,
Columbia Law Review, October 2017
https://columbialawreview.org/content/paying-for-privacy-and-the-personal-data-economy/

Technological Self-Incrimination: The Precedent of Biometric Unlocking,
Columbia Undergraduate Law Review, October 31, 2017
https://www.culawreview.org/journal/technological-self-incrimination-the-precedent-of-biometric-unlocking

Biometric Privacy Law as Applied To Virtual Reality and Immersive Technologies,
Science and Technology Law Review, Columbia University, January 31, 2022
https://journals.library.columbia.edu/index.php/stlr/blog/view/420

Europe's Next Steps in Regulating Facial Recognition Technology,
Columbia Journal of Transnational Law, November 7, 2021
https://www.jtl.columbia.edu/bulletin-blog/europes-next-steps-in-regulating-facial-recognition-technology

The Use of Biometric Data for Personal Identification Purposes,
Science and Technology Law Review, Columbia University, November 13, 2017
https://journals.library.columbia.edu/index.php/stlr/blog/view/172

OPTIONAL RESEARCH (ARTICLES & VIDEOS): *Continued…*

Voice Analytics and Artificial Intelligence: Future Directions for a post-COVID world,
Wharton School of Business, UPenn, August 5, 2020
https://aiab.wharton.upenn.edu/white-paper/voice-analytics-and-artificial-intelligence-future-directions-for-a-post-covid-world/

After Equifax, Can Our Data Ever Be Safe?,
Wharton School of Business, UPenn, September 19, 2017
https://knowledge.wharton.upenn.edu/article/equifax-can-data-ever-safe/

Police surveillance and facial recognition: Why data privacy is imperative for communities of color,
Brookings Institution, April 12, 2022
https://www.brookings.edu/research/police-surveillance-and-facial-recognition-why-data-privacy-is-an-imperative-for-communities-of-color/

The enduring risks posed by biometric identification systems,
Brookings Institution, February 9, 2022
https://www.brookings.edu/techstream/the-enduring-risks-posed-by-biometric-identification-systems/

Mitigating bias and equity in use of facial recognition technology by the U.S. Customs and Border Protection,
Brookings Institution, July 27, 2022
https://www.brookings.edu/testimonies/mitigating-bias-and-equity-in-use-of-facial-recognition-technology-by-the-u-s-customs-and-border-protection/

Mandating fairness and accuracy assessments for law enforcement facial recognition systems,
Brookings Institution, May 26, 2021
https://www.brookings.edu/blog/techtank/2021/05/26/mandating-fairness-and-accuracy-assessments-for-law-enforcement-facial-recognition-systems/

What are the proper limits on police use of facial recognition?,
Brookings Institution, June 20, 2019
https://www.brookings.edu/blog/techtank/2021/05/26/mandating-fairness-and-accuracy-assessments-for-law-enforcement-facial-recognition-systems/

Facial Recognition Technology Is Getting out of Control,
CATO Institute, March 9, 2020 [PDF]
https://www.cato.org/commentary/facial-recognition-technology-getting-out-control

Giving TSA Facial-Recognition Software Isn't Worth a Faster Security Line,
CATO Institute, September 24, 2018
https://www.cato.org/commentary/giving-tsa-facial-recognition-software-isnt-worth-faster-security-line

Heritage Expert Testifies to Congress on Facial Recognition Technology,
Heritage Foundation, July 26, 2021
https://www.heritage.org/impact/heritage-expert-testifies-congress-facial-recognition-technology

Addressing Legitimate Concerns About Government Use of Facial Recognition Technologies,
Heritage Foundation, October 30, 2020
https://www.heritage.org/civil-rights/report/addressing-legitimate-concerns-about-government-use-facial-recognition

CONTACT INFORMATION (Coach Bill):

Bill Eddy,
billeddy@gmail.com
714.655.8135 (I prefer text)
When contacting me, please include your name and class information (day/time). Thanks!